ALSTON&BIRD LLP

ALSIUN®DIKL



WWW.ALSTON.COM

Environment, Land Use & Natural Resources ADVISORY •

OCTOBER 29, 2014

Fourth Circuit to Address CERCLA's Intent to Dispose Standard

On October 30, the Fourth Circuit will hear oral argument in a closely-watched Superfund case, *Duke Energy Progress, Inc. v. Consolidation Coal Co.*¹The appeal involves the "intent to dispose" standard for arranger liability that the Supreme Court set out in *Burlington Northern v. United States.*²

CERCLA Arranger Liability

Liability under the Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation, and Liability Act (CERCLA) includes any person who "arranges for" the disposal or treatment of a hazardous substance.³ Five years ago, in *Burlington Northern*, the Supreme Court held that "an entity may qualify as an arranger . . . when it takes intentional steps to dispose of a hazardous substance." In so holding, the Court established the endpoints of the arranger liability spectrum.

Liability, the Court said, would attach if "an entity were to enter into a transaction for the sole purpose of discarding a used and no longer useful hazardous substance." But liability would not attach if an entity sold "a new and useful product" that the purchaser later, unbeknownst to the seller, disposed of in a manner that resulted in contamination.⁵

Ward Transformer Site

This litigation involves cleanup costs for PCB impacts at the Ward Transformer Superfund Site ("Ward"), a former transformer sales and repair facility in North Carolina. Plaintiff Consolidation Coal Co. and third-party plaintiff PCS Phosphate are appealing the district court's dismissal of defendant Georgia Power on summary judgment grounds. ⁶

This advisory is published by Alston & Bird LLP to provide a summary of significant developments to our clients and friends. It is intended to be informational and does not constitute legal advice regarding any specific situation. This material may also be considered attorney advertising under court rules of certain jurisdictions.

¹ Carolina Power & Light Co. v. Alcan Aluminum Corp., 921 F. Supp. 2d. 488 (E.D.N.C. 2013), appeal docketed, No. 13-1306 (4th Cir. May 10, 2013).

² 556 U.S. 599 (2009).

³ 42 U.S.C. § 9607(a)(3).

⁴ Burlington Northern, 556 U.S. at 611.

⁵ *Id*. at 609–10.

The parties in agreed to use a test-case process "to streamline the litigation." *Carolina Power & Light Co. v. 3M Co.*, Nos. 5:08-CV-00460, 5:08-CV-00463, at *2 (E.D.N.C. Apr. 30, 2013). Georgia Power agreed to serve as the test case for the defendants that allegedly sold used transformers to Ward.

WWW.ALSTON.COM 2

According to the parties' filings, Georgia Power sold over 100 used transformers to Ward in the early 1980s, which Ward repaired prior to reselling them to third parties. Not all of the transformers were drained prior to shipment to Ward, and some had PCB-containing oil. Therefore, the district court conducted a fact-intensive inquiry to determine Georgia Power's alleged intent for CERCLA liability purposes.

The district court held that specific intent to dispose of hazardous substances must be proven to meet the arranger liability standard contemplated by *Burlington Northern*. Applying that standard to Georgia Power's transactions, the plaintiffs argued that the fact that Ward had to repair the transformers prior their resale, including the removal of defective parts, constituted arrangement for disposal. The district court disagreed, holding that (1) the transformers were not leaking upon sale to Ward; (2) the transformers had marketable value, even if repairs were required; and (3) Georgia Power had no knowledge that Ward might spill any PCB-containing oils during the course of such repairs. The district court therefore concluded that Georgia Power could not be held liable as a CERCLA arranger as a matter of law.

The parties filed their respective briefs last spring, and the Fourth Circuit is expected to issue a decision by April 2015. If you have questions about the appeal or the Ward litigation generally, please contact <u>Doug Arnold, Sarah Babcock</u> or <u>Geoff Rathgeber</u>.

If you would like to receive future Environment, Land Use & Natural Resources Advisories electronically, please forward your contact information to environmental.advisory@alston.com. Be sure to put "subscribe" in the subject line.

If you have any questions or would like additional information, please contact your Alston & Bird attorney or any of the following:

Doug Arnold 404.881.7637

doug.arnold@alston.com

Sarah Babcock 404.881.7632

sarah.babcock@alston.com

Ward Benshoof 213.576.1108

ward.benshoof@alston.com

Meaghan Goodwin Boyd 404.881.7245

meaghan.boyd@alston.com

Andrew Brady 213.576.2527 andrew.brady@alston.com

Nicki Carlsen 213,576,1128

nicki.carlsen@alston.com

Edward Casey 213.576.1005 ed.casey@alston.com

Lee DeHihns 404.881.7151

lee.dehihns@alston.com

Skip Fulton 404.881.7152

skip.fulton@alston.com

Maureen Gorsen 916.498.3305

maureen.gorsen@alston.com

Ronnie Gosselin 404.881.7965

ronnie.gosselin@alston.com

Maya Lopez Grasse 213.576.2526

maya.grasse@alston.com

Mark Johnson 213.576.1089

mark.johnson@alston.com

Clay Massey 404.881.4969

clay.massey@alston.com

Elise Paeffgen 202.239.3939

elise.paeffgen@alston.com

Bruce Pasfield 202.239.3585

bruce.pasfield@alston.com

Geoffrey Rathgeber 404.881.4974

geoff.rathgeber@alston.com

Beverlee Silva 404.881.4625

beverlee.silva@alston.com

Jocelyn Thompson 213.576.1104

jocelyn.thompson@alston.com

Andrea Warren 213.576.2518

andrea.warren@alston.com

Jonathan Wells 404.881.7472

jonathan.wells@alston.com

Diane Wizig 404.881.4954

diane.wizig@alston.com

ALSTON&BIRD LLP

WWW.ALSTON.COM

© ALSTON & BIRD LLP 2014

ATLANTA: One Atlantic Center • 1201 West Peachtree Street • Atlanta, Georgia, USA, 30309-3424 • 404.881.7000 • Fax: 404.881.7777 BRUSSELS: Level 20 Bastion Tower ■ Place du Champ de Mars ■ B-1050 Brussels, BE ■ +32 2 550 3700 ■ Fax: +32 2 550 3719 CHARLOTTE: Bank of America Plaza • 101 South Tryon Street • Suite 4000 • Charlotte, North Carolina, USA, 28280-4000 • 704.444.1000 • Fax: 704.444.1111 DALLAS: 2828 North Harwood Street ■ 18th Floor ■ Dallas, Texas, USA, 75201 ■ 214.922.3400 ■ Fax: 214.922.3899 LOS ANGELES: 333 South Hope Street ■ 16th Floor ■ Los Angeles, California, USA, 90071-3004 ■ 213.576.1000 ■ Fax: 213.576.1100 NEW YORK: 90 Park Avenue ■ 15th Floor ■ New York, New York, USA, 10016-1387 ■ 212.210.9400 ■ Fax: 212.210.9444 RESEARCH TRIANGLE: 4721 Emperor Blvd. ■ Suite 400 ■ Durham, North Carolina, USA, 27703-85802 ■ 919.862.2200 ■ Fax: 919.862.2260 SILICON VALLEY: 1950 University Avenue • 5th Floor • East Palo Alto, California, USA, 94303-2282 • 650.838.2000 • Fax: 650.838.2001 WASHINGTON, DC: The Atlantic Building • 950 F Street, NW • Washington, DC, USA, 20004-1404 • 202.756.3300 • Fax: 202.756.3333